REQUEST FOR QUALIFICATIONS
RFQ #19-11-388

CIVIL/GENERAL ENGINEERING, WATER/WASTEWATER TREATMENT PLANT ENGINEERING, SURVEYING AND MAPPING, ARCHITECTURAL DESIGN, AND GEO-TECHNICAL SERVICES

MINUTES OF EVALUATION COMMITTEE MEETING
January 15, 2020

The Evaluation Committee met on Wednesday, January 15, 2020, in the First Floor Conference Room at City Hall, 701 SW 71 Avenue. The meeting convened at 10:29 a.m.

City Staff Attending:
Susan Nabors, Finance Director
Danielle Keira-Cancel, Accounting & Purchasing Coordinator
Patricia Vancheri, City Clerk
Michael Cirullo, City Attorney

Evaluation Committee Attending:
Brandy Leighton, NL Assistant Public Works Director
Mustafa Albassam, City of Tamarac - City Engineer
Mark Collins, City of Margate – Public Works Director

Bidders Attending:
Freddie Vargas, CPC. Inc.
Kristen Lawlor, Keith Marketing Director
James Messick, Calvin Giordano & Associates

Danielle Keira-Cancel convened the meeting at 10:29 a.m. Members of the Evaluation Committee introduced themselves. Ms. Keira-Cancel stated that the purpose of the meeting is to rank the responses to this RFQ and Committee members were asked to turn in their Conflict of Interest Disclosure Form as well as their signed Evaluation Committee Policy and Procedures form. Scores were submitted for five (5) disciplines and scores were read into the record by vendor and given a final scoring as follows:

Architectural Design
1. Pasquale Kuritzky Arch., Inc.
   a. Brandy Leighton 67
   b. Mustafa Albassam 87
   c. Mark Collins 60
   Average 71.33

2. Saltz Michelson
   a. Brandy Leighton 95
   b. Mustafa Albassam 91
   c. Mark Collins 76
   Average 87.33

3. Walters Zackria Architects
   a. Brandy Leighton 93
   b. Mustafa Albassam 95
   c. Mark Collins 65
   Average 84.33
4. West Architecture & Design LLC
   a. Brandy Leighton  77
   b. Mustafa Albassam  91
   c. Mark Collins  73
       Average  80.33

Survey & Mapping
1. CGA Inc.
   a. Brandy Leighton  79
   b. Mustafa Albassam  95
   c. Mark Collins  95
       Average  89.66

2. CPC
   a. Brandy Leighton  72
   b. Mustafa Albassam  89
   c. Mark Collins  84
       Average  81.66

3. Craven Thompson & Associates
   a. Brandy Leighton  94
   b. Mustafa Albassam  88
   c. Mark Collins  84
       Average  88.66

4. JMT
   a. Brandy Leighton  89
   b. Mustafa Albassam  88
   c. Mark Collins  82
       Average  86.33

5. Keith
   a. Brandy Leighton  80
   b. Mustafa Albassam  90
   c. Mark Collins  83
       Average  84.33

6. Engenuity
   a. Brandy Leighton  78
   b. Mustafa Albassam  94
   c. Mark Collins  78
       Average  83.33
**Geo Technical Services**

1. Radise International
   a. Brandy Leighton 75
   b. Mustafa Albassam 93
   c. Mark Collins 80
   Average 82.66

2. Terracon
   a. Brandy Leighton 81
   b. Mustafa Albassam 92
   c. Mark Collins 85
   Average 86.00

3. Tierra South Florida, Inc.
   a. Brandy Leighton 95
   b. Mustafa Albassam 95
   c. Mark Collins 88
   Average 92.66

4. Universal Engineering Sciences
   a. Brandy Leighton 83
   b. Mustafa Albassam 91
   c. Mark Collins 85
   Average 86.33

**Water/Wastewater Treatment**

1. CGA Inc.
   a. Brandy Leighton 83
   b. Mustafa Albassam 89
   c. Mark Collins 95
   Average 89.00

2. CPH, Inc.
   a. Brandy Leighton 92
   b. Mustafa Albassam 89
   c. Mark Collins 77
   Average 86.00

3. Hazen & Sawyer
   a. Brandy Leighton 91
   b. Mustafa Albassam 93
   c. Mark Collins 95
   Average 93.00

4. Kimley Horn
   a. Brandy Leighton 86
   b. Mustafa Albassam 89
   c. Mark Collins 87
   Average 87.33
## Civil/General Engineering

1. Calvin Giordano & Associates (CGA)
   a. Brandy Leighton 88
   b. Mustafa Albassam 90
   c. Mark Collins 95
   Average 91.00

2. Carnahan Proctor & Cross (PPC)
   a. Brandy Leighton 77
   b. Mustafa Albassam 90
   c. Mark Collins 77
   Average 81.33

3. Chen Moore & Associates
   a. Brandy Leighton 94
   b. Mustafa Albassam 92
   c. Mark Collins 90
   Average 92.00

4. CPH, INC.
   a. Brandy Leighton 84
   b. Mustafa Albassam 89
   c. Mark Collins 77
   Average 83.33

5. Craven Thompson & Associates
   a. Brandy Leighton 84
   b. Mustafa Albassam 90
   c. Mark Collins 84
   Average 86.00

6. Engenuity Group, Inc.
   a. Brandy Leighton 80
   b. Mustafa Albassam 92
   c. Mark Collins 77
   Average 83.00

7. JMT
   a. Brandy Leighton 83
   b. Mustafa Albassam 87
   c. Mark Collins 80
   Average 83.33

8. Keith
   a. Brandy Leighton 78
   b. Mustafa Albassam 89
   c. Mark Collins 87
   Average 84.66
9. Lakdas Yohalem Engineering  
   a. Brandy Leighton 75  
   b. Mustafa Albassam 90  
   c. Mark Collins 100  
   Average 88.33

10. R. J. Behar & Company, Inc.  
   a. Brandy Leighton 88  
   b. Mustafa Albassam 94  
   c. Mark Collins 78  
   Average 86.66

11. Beta Jones Group  
   a. Brandy Leighton 64  
   b. Mustafa Albassam 87  
   c. Mark Collins 68  
   Average 73.00

12. The Corradino Group  
   a. Brandy Leighton 80  
   b. Mustafa Albassam 90  
   c. Mark Collins 78  
   Average 82.66

Ms. Keira-Cancel stated that the scores would be calculated for each discipline separately. City Attorney Michael Cirullo interjected that once the scores are calculated for each discipline, the Committee would select at least three (3) to come back for discussions next week per Florida Statutes. Ms. Keira-Cancel agreed and stated that the calendar invite has been changed to reflect that those mandatory meetings will be in Commission Chambers. Attorney Cirullo re-iterated at least three (3), but the Committee could hear from more if they choose. All score sheets were collected by Susan Nabors, Finance Director, who indicated that if the Committee had any comments, they could do so at this time.

**Top Ranked Firms:**

**Geo-Technical Services**

1. Tierra South Florida 92.66  
2. Universal Engineering 86.33  
3. Terracon 86.00  

Mark Collins made a motion to move forward the three (3) top-ranked firms to the next meeting for interviews. Seconded by Mustafa Albassam. All in favor. Ms. Nabors stated the firms will be notified.

**Civil/General Engineering**

1. Chen Moore & Associates 92.00  
2. Calvin Giordano & Assoc. 91.00  
3. Lakdas Yohalem 88.33  
4. R. J. Behar & Company 86.66  

Mark Collins made a motion to interview the four (4) top-ranked firms. Seconded by Mustafa Albassam. All in favor.

**Water/Wastewater Engineering**

1. Hazen & Sawyer 93.00  
2. CGA, Inc. 89.00  
3. CPH, Inc. 87.66  

Mark Collins made a motion to interview the top three (3) top-ranked firms. Seconded by Mustafa Albassam. All in favor.
Survey and Mapping

1. CGA, Inc. 89.66
2. Craven Thompson & Assoc. 88.66
3. JMT 86.33
4. Keith 84.33

Mustafa Albassam made a motion to interview the top four (4). Seconded by Mark Collins. All in favor.

Architectural Design

1. Saltz Michelson 87.33
2. Walters Zackria 84.33
3. West Agricultural 80.33

Mark Collins moved to interview the top three (3) firms. Seconded by Mustafa Albassam. All in favor.

Susan Nabors commented on the next steps and mentioned that some time would be added to the schedule for next week’s meetings because of the volume of seventeen (17) firms coming back for presentations. The Committee discussed the time that would be allowed for presentations and Q & A. Attorney Cirullo interjected that the time set is not just for presentations, but to speak to the presenters and discuss their qualifications as well. He also commented that after the presentations the Committee will short rank the firms again to present the ranking order to the City Commission for authority to negotiate with the top ranked firms first in each of the categories. A bidder in attendance asked if the ranking would be based on just the presentations or will it include the scoring. Attorney Cirullo said the Committee will give a fresh ranking to move forward. Susan Nabors, Finance Director, also stated that they will re-rank after the Committee has the opportunity to re-evaluate those firms that come in to present. Scoring will be based on the same criteria, but scores may or may not change after presentations. Danielle Keira-Cancel will notify the firms that have been selected to present to give them time to prepare. The Committee discussed the time schedule and intervals for presentations for the five disciplines. It was suggested that the firms may need at least two weeks to prepare their presentations. After discussion, City Attorney suggested a motion to postpone the meetings scheduled next week and to schedule presentations no sooner than January 29th to allow time to advise the short-listed firms that they will be expected to present. Ms. Keira-Cancel asked if these presentations would be open to the public. Attorney Cirullo replied that the meetings would be noticed and open. Consensus of the Committee was to schedule presentations for 20 minutes with a 10 minute Q & A max per firm. Scoring will be performed after Q & A session with a motion to rank the top firm.

It was determined that the following meetings would be scheduled:
- January 29th at 1:00 pm for the Geo-Technical discipline
- February 5th at 8:30 am for Civil/General Engineering
- February 10th at 8:30 am for Surveying & Mapping
- February 10th at 1:30 pm for Water/Waste Water Engineering
- February 11th at 8:30 am for Architectural Design

Ms. Nabors said this will be added to everyone’s calendar as soon as possible. Attorney Cirullo suggested a motion be made to cancel the meeting originally scheduled for January 22nd and to schedule the presentations as set forth. That motion was made by Mark Collins and seconded by Mustafa Albassam. All in favor. Ms. Keira-Cancel will provide necessary addendum which will also be posted on City website and DemandStar.

No further business, the meeting adjourned at 11:47 am.

Respectfully submitted,
Patricia Vancheri, City Clerk
# RFQ #19-11-388

**CIVIL/GENERAL ENGINEERING, WATER/WASTEWATER TREATMENT PLANT ENGINEERING, SURVEYING AND MAPPING, ARCHITECTURAL DESIGN, AND GEO-TECHNICAL SERVICES**

**SIGN-IN SHEET**

**WEDNESDAY, JANUARY 15, 2020**

**10:00 AM EST**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>NAME</th>
<th>COMPANY / TITLE</th>
<th>EMAIL ADDRESS</th>
<th>SIGNATURE</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Patti Vancheri</td>
<td>CNL / City Clerk</td>
<td><a href="mailto:pvancheri@nlauderdale.org">pvancheri@nlauderdale.org</a></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Danielle Cancel</td>
<td>CNL / Purchasing Coordinator</td>
<td><a href="mailto:dkcancel@nlauderdale.org">dkcancel@nlauderdale.org</a></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Susan Nabors</td>
<td>CNL / Finance Director</td>
<td><a href="mailto:snabors@nlauderdale.org">snabors@nlauderdale.org</a></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mark Collins</td>
<td>CM / Public Works Director</td>
<td><a href="mailto:mcollins@margatefl.com">mcollins@margatefl.com</a></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Brandy Leighton</td>
<td>CNL / Assistant Public Works Director</td>
<td><a href="mailto:bleighton@nlauderdal.org">bleighton@nlauderdal.org</a></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mustafa Albassam</td>
<td>CT / City Engineer</td>
<td><a href="mailto:mustafa.albassam@tamarac.org">mustafa.albassam@tamarac.org</a></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Freddie Vargas</td>
<td>CPC, Inc</td>
<td><a href="mailto:fvargas@cpc-eng.com">fvargas@cpc-eng.com</a></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kristin Lawlor</td>
<td>KEITH- Marketing Director</td>
<td><a href="mailto:klawlor@keith-lawlor.com">klawlor@keith-lawlor.com</a></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>James Massick</td>
<td>Calvin Giordano &amp; Associates</td>
<td><a href="mailto:jmessick@CGASolutions.com">jmessick@CGASolutions.com</a></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Brandy Leighton</td>
<td>CM / ASP Public Works</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mark E. Collins</td>
<td>City of Margate/ Pro Dir.</td>
<td><a href="mailto:mcollins@maagaretefl.com">mcollins@maagaretefl.com</a></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
RFQ #19-11-388
CIVIL/GENERAL ENGINEERING, WATER/WASTEWATER TREATMENT PLANT ENGINEERING, SURVEYING
AND MAPPING, ARCHITECTURAL DESIGN, AND GEO-TECHNICAL SERVICES
SIGN-IN SHEET
WEDNESDAY, JANUARY 15, 2020
10:00 AM EST

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>NAME</th>
<th>COMPANY / TITLE</th>
<th>EMAIL ADDRESS</th>
<th>SIGNATURE</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>